

MINUTES of MEETING of ARGYLL AND BUTE LOCAL REVIEW BODY held in the COUNCIL CHAMBER, KILMORY, LOCHGILPHEAD on WEDNESDAY, 15 AUGUST 2012

Present: Councillor Sandy Taylor (Chair)
Councillor Rory Colville Councillor George Freeman

Attending: Iain Jackson, Governance Officer (Adviser)
Fiona McCallum, Committee Services Officer (Minute Taker)

1. CONSIDER NOTICE OF REVIEW: KILDAVAIG FARM, TIGHNABRUAICH, ARGYLL, PA21 2AH

The Chair welcomed everyone to the meeting and advised that his first task would be to establish whether or not the LRB felt they had sufficient information before them to reach a decision on the Review.

Councillor Freeman advised that he felt that he had enough information before him in order to reach a decision on the Review.

Councillor Currie advised that he did not think the information provided was sufficient and that it would be beneficial for the LRB to have more information on what the visual impact of the wind turbine upon the Area of Panoramic Quality would be and that this could be sought either by undertaking a site visit or obtaining photographic evidence. He also advised that he would like further information provided on how far from outwith the Rural Opportunity Area the wind turbine was proposed to be sited.

The Chair agreed that it would be beneficial to receive the further information suggested by Councillor Currie and after further discussion Councillor Freeman was happy to support his colleagues.

Decision

The LRB agreed:-

1. To request from Planners photographic evidence of the visual impact the proposed wind turbine would have upon the Area of Panoramic Quality from the farm houses on the Island of Bute and around the Ardlamont Peninsula;
2. To request from Planners a detailed map showing the location of the proposed turbine in relation to the Rural Opportunity Area surrounding the farm; and
3. To adjourn the meeting and reconvene at a later date.

**The Argyll and Bute Local Review Body re-convened on Tuesday 25
September 2012 at 3.00 pm in the Council Chamber, Kilmory,
Lochgilphead**

Present: Councillor Sandy Taylor (Chair)
Councillor Robin Currie
Councillor George Freeman

Attending: Iain Jackson, Governance Officer (Adviser)
Fiona McCallum, Committee Services (Minute Taker)

The Chair welcomed everyone to the meeting and advised that his first task would be to establish whether or not the LRB felt they now had sufficient information before them to reach a decision on the Review following receipt of the further written information requested.

The ABLRB agreed that they now had enough information before and proceeded to determine the case.

With the aid of presentation slides the Members examined a series of photographs and maps provided by Planning.

After careful consideration the ABLRB agreed that the proposal was contrary to a number of planning policies, the scale of the wind turbine would have an adverse impact upon the Area of Panoramic Quality and in this case they could find no justification for departing from planning policy.

Decision

It was agreed to uphold the original decision to refuse planning permission for the following reason detailed in the Planner's report:-

For the purposes of the document titled '*Landscape Assessment of Argyll and the Firth of Clyde*' (Environmental Resources Management 1996), the application site is located within "*Rocky Mosaic*". This character type usually forms an irregular narrow coastal or loch edge. The rolling landform of the landscape provides strong containment and the presence of small woodlands, fields and settlement reinforces its predominantly small scale. These loch shores and coastal fringes make an important contribution to the wider scenic context, forming an intricately patterned band between the foreground of sea or loch and backed by simple and more expansive upland landscapes.

Whilst there may be some scope for the smaller type of turbine such as the one referred to in this application within the "Rocky Mosaic" character type, it is considered that the proposed turbine would be located in a skyline location that would not have rising ground as a backdrop. This skyline appearance would be highly visible from the public road that traverses the Ardlamont peninsula and would also be viewed from the north west part of the Isle of Bute around Kildavannan, Glecknabae and Kilmichael.

On the basis of the foregoing, it is considered that the proposal would

have an adverse impact upon the Area of Panoramic Quality and would be contrary to the following policies:

Argyll & Bute Structure Plan (2002)

STRAT DC 5 – *‘Development in Sensitive Countryside’*
STRAT RE 1 – *‘Wind Farm/Wind Farm Turbine Development’*

Argyll & Bute Local Plan (2009)

LP ENV 1 – *‘Development Impact on the General Environment’*
LP ENV 10 – *‘Development Impact on Areas of Panoramic Quality’*
LP ENV 19 – *‘Development Setting, Layout & Design’*
LP REN 1 – *‘Wind Farms and Wind Turbines’*

(Reference: Notice of Review and Supporting Documentation, Comments from Interested Parties and Further Written Submissions, submitted)